

Undergraduate Thesis Assessment Rubric
Department of English, Faculty of Education, University of West Bohemia

Thesis Author: **Tomáš Kilbergr**
 Title: *Manifestation of Welsh Nationalism and Identity in Contemporary [Wales]*
 Length: 47 pages
 Text Length: 53 pages

Assessment Criteria	Scale	Comments
1. Introduction is well written, brief, interesting, and compelling. It motivates the work and provides a clear statement of the examined issue. It presents and overview of the thesis.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
2. The thesis shows the author's appropriate knowledge of the subject matter through the background/review of literature. The author presents information from a variety of quality electronic and print sources. Sources are relevant, balanced and include critical readings relating to the thesis or problem. Primary sources are included (if appropriate).	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
3. The author carefully analyzed the information collected and drew appropriate and inventive conclusions supported by evidence. Ideas are richly supported with accurate details that develop the main point. The author's voice is evident.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
4. The thesis displays critical thinking and avoids simplistic description or summary of information.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
5. Conclusion effectively restates the argument. It summarizes the main findings and follows logically from the analysis presented.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
6. The text is organized in a logical manner. It flows naturally and is easy to follow. Transitions, summaries and conclusions exist as appropriate. The author uses standard spelling, grammar, and punctuation.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
7. The language use is precise. The student makes proficient use of language in a way that is appropriate for the discipline and/or genre in which the student is writing.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	
8. The thesis meets the general requirements (formatting, chapters, length, division into sections, etc.). References are cited properly within the text and a complete reference list is provided.	Outstanding Very good Acceptable Somewhat deficient Very deficient	

The thesis provides a generally competent overview of the complexity of Welsh national identity. The author's text is logically organised and the argumentation strong enough to withstand the occasional stylistic eccentricity.

Questions

1. The author stresses the importance of the Welsh language in the context of his topic: "Clearly, the Welsh language is considered to be the main sign of Welsh identity that is open to anyone who wants to be a part of the Welsh nation" (p. 26). The claim is reiterated on p. 32: "The most influential criterion is undoubtedly the language, which is the main element of identification." But then where, in terms of identity, does this leave the vast majority of the current population of Wales who do not speak the language? Is there not a danger that they might be considered somehow 'less Welsh', as it were?
2. On p. 30 we read that "social geographic differences provide a basis on which it can be argued that there are different kinds of Welsh people, or different kinds of Welshness, made visible in attitudes and behaviour" (the OU, para. 2.2). Could this idea perhaps be extended beyond the typical example given, namely that of rural vs. urban – a contrast which, in itself, is not confined to Wales?
3. In the concluding remarks on p. 33, the author suggests "a deeper study would discover a significant relationship between language and identity which is crucial for Welsh nationalism". Mr Kilbergr, however, has already described this phenomenon – indeed, even made it the most fundamental point of the current thesis. Further research might bolster the argument but is there really so much more in this area that still remains to be discovered?
4. What implications (if any) might the forthcoming Scottish referendum have for Wales – particularly if the YES camp were to prevail?

Recommended grade: **velmi dobře**

Supervisor: Andrew Tollet

Date: 15th August 2014

Signature:

